Creation of Sustainable Livelihoods for Internally Displaced and Returning Afghan Families in Kabul Province

Mid Term External Evaluation
Project-No.: AFG 1176
Overall budget: 2,584,297€
Conducted by:

ASK
Training And Consulting
Report submitted by:

ASK Training and Consulting
November-2017

Address all correspondence to:

Phone: +93 790 63 69 60
Email: info@askariaconsulting.com

Evaluation Team:

Millad Ayan, Lead Consultant
Calvin Madzorera, Data Quality Assurance Consultant
Caterina Monti, Technical Consultant
Jumare Abdulazeez, Quantitative Data Analyst Consultant
Acknowledgements

ASK would like to thank Dr. Farshid Farzam, WHH Regional Manager, Mr. Hussain Saeedi, Project Manager and Ihsanullah Mulakhail, Field Officer for organizing and coordinating the evaluation. ASK thanks the support and coordination of AECC and ANAFAE project team. A big tashakhor goes to the community mobilization team of WHH who accompanied the ASK data collection team into the field.
I. Introduction

Creation of Sustainable Livelihoods for Internally Displaced and Returning Afghan Families in Kabul Province is a project being implemented by Welthungerhilfe Afghanistan in partnership with two local NGOs – Afghan Educational Children's Circus (AECC) and Afghanistan National Association for Adult Education (ANAFAE) between July 2015 and March 2019. This project is targeting 23,485 vulnerable internally displaced people (IDPs), returnees and host community residents in three adjacent districts of Kabul Province, including the districts of Kabul, Paghman and Shakar Dara. The project also intends to enhance the capacities of other key stakeholders – 25 government staff and 50 IDP community representatives to support the primary target group by addressing marginalization and creating an environment that supports integration, diversification of livelihoods and representation in political dialogues.

II. Executive Summary

1. Brief Description of the Project and Framework Conditions

AECC was founded in 2002 with a focus on teaching children how to lead thereby promoting child-to-child learning. AECC implements programs in the fields of child protection and educational training through recreational activities by giving children tools to use to develop creative ways of learning. AECC also acts as a stakeholder (advocacy). A total of 34 employees are under contract. Welthungerhilfe has been successfully working with AECC for over 3 years.

ANAFAE, founded in September 2005 by the "Institut für internationale Zusammenarbeit des Deutschen Hochschulverbands", is an umbrella organization that fosters the development of local adult education centers. Main objectives of its activities are to promote the training of young adults, continuing education, literacy and vocational training. Currently, more than 480 employees are working in 21 local adult education centers in 12 provinces.

The project aims to empower marginalized and vulnerable IDPs, returnees and host community residents to become agents of their own change by giving them the skills to combat their marginalization and providing them with an enabling environment for this endeavor.

In August 2017, a midterm evaluation was carried out to measure impact generated by the project whose expected results focused on improved adult literacy, psychosocial support and recreational facilities offered to children, capacity building offered to improve poultry production and food processing, improving agricultural production through production techniques and irrigation and finally improving the wellbeing of IDP communities by promoting dialogue, knowledge and implementation of the IDP policy.

This evaluation relied largely on quantitative and qualitative data. A mixture of methods used in this evaluation included literature review, quantitative survey, key informant interviews, focus group discussions and direct site visits where observations were done and documented using photographs. For each category of participant, there was a questionnaire developed and used to gather the needed data. A total of 798 people participated in the evaluation with the breakdown as follows – 137 men, 370 women and 291 children. The quantitative data was analyzed using SPSS.
and qualitative data was analyzed using content analysis and the thematic areas were used as the criteria of evaluation.

2. **Relevance**
The project has been considered as relevant by its beneficiaries and effectively targeting the activities in the areas which needed support most. Its relevance has been deemed also adequate to the social set-up to the areas where the project activities are being implemented and the cultural restrictions providing ad hoc activities for women.

3. **Effectiveness**
The project was selected with the full involvement of the community. There was regular monitoring of implementation of the project with action taken to change course as needed e.g. when people in Shakar Dara demanded cash instead of participating in the capacity building for fruit processing, the project was moved to Paghman district after consultation with key stakeholders enabling it to meet the objective of improving literacy and skills in fruit processing.

Overall, with the improved literacy, it was easy for the women to understand the training given in poultry keeping and fruit processing. In turn, this enabled them to market their produce well and earn an income that they used to supplement the family income and buy other needs for themselves and their families contributing to general wellbeing and livelihood of the household.

4. **Efficiency**
Overall the project will achieve the targets within budget and efficient utilization of resources. There has not been significant delay in project implementation that would affect the efficiency of the project. All the activities, have been done on time. However, in general terms, the training given, the setting up of child friendly spaces and the construction of irrigation infrastructure have been efficiently done.

5. **Outcomes and impacts**
Comparison with baseline data indicates that there has been an increase in household income because of the literacy and fruit processing project, literacy and poultry farming project and agricultural activities using irrigation water. The literacy skills of the beneficiaries have improved as they can now read; write and they can count and know how much their change will be when buying goods. The women have been economically empowered and are appreciated and supported by husband in their income generating activities. There is an overall increase in skills across all the project components across the board.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Midline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literacy (Reading and Writing)</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>96%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fruit Processing</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contribution to HH income by women</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>73% from fruit processing 76% from poultry and eggs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. Sustainability
The farmers will continue the project without WHH support and guidance since the land and the canal are theirs. The availability of irrigation water and relative peace in Kabul will ensure sustainability and they are able to grow more crops. The fruit-processing project will continue after the end of donor funding because the beneficiaries have gained knowledge on fruit processing and are committed to continuing this activity as it brings income to the household. Furthermore, the women will continue to advocate for women literacy since they are reaping the benefits for the literacy program which they attended which has positively impacted fruit processing business. The literacy training and marketing skills acquired by the poultry farmers and incubators provided will ensure that the project is sustainable after the end of donor funding. The project is being implemented at a low cost that ensures sustainability and AECC has trained master trainers who will be able carry out the activities after end of donor funding.

7. Challenges
Some of the challenges reported include inadequate irrigation water especially for those in the village of Kabri Kabar. Also due to conflicting priorities, the literacy class for men had to be cancelled as they dropped out in order to work to provide for their families. The project experienced staff turnover – they had to replace engineers thrice as the ones employed left for other organizations.

8. Recommendations
As a result of the positive impact realized by the women involved in the literacy program this should be continued if possible to have more classes to cater for those women who had been left out after the required number of learner per class had been achieved. More spaces should be made available for additional women to be trained in poultry and fruit processing. For men to benefit from these literacy classes, the project should consider rescheduling classes to a time when there is low demand for labor so that they can easily participate without worrying about missing work and income as they attend the classes.

It is recommended that community members be trained to offer psychosocial support to supplement the services given by the project staff.

In addition to the feasibility study done, there should also have been an assessment detailing the amount of arable land available for cultivation, estimation of water needed to irrigate this land so that the project is designed based on this. In addition to this, in order to increase amount of land under cultivation, more canals can be built to prevent farms from drying.

Coordination
WHH has done much to share information and participate in coordination forums with other similar organizations including organizing workshops to increase awareness on the IDP policy among stakeholders. There exist more opportunities for WHH to enhance coordination and synergies amongst the local and international NGOs and the government.

9. General conclusions and “lessons learnt”
Generally, the projects were selected with the full involvement of the community and the positive outcomes have been achieved such as improved literacy, generation of income by women from the
sale of poultry products and processed fruit products. There was environmental impact assessment done before the construction of the irrigation canal to determine risks and develop a mitigation strategy. The feasibility study should have included other aspects of the irrigation project. This would have given information the amount of arable land available to be irrigated, the amount of water needed and the sources from which the water would come from were not known. The feasibility study done only indicated the technical aspects of the canal construction highlighting the preferred design given reasons why it was the best choice.