

Evaluation mi-parcours du projet PASSAT

Summary of mid-term evaluation in English

Brief description of the project and framework conditions

The project PASSAT aim is to reinforce the resilience of the population of the town Tuléar and two adjoining rural zones Zombitse and Mikea.

This evaluation is limited to the urban part of the PASSAT project that has the objective to realise a working waste management system in Tuléar. The WHH (Welthungerhilfe) is responsible for the implementation of the project, which is funded by BMZ.

The project has identified several actors and beneficiaries. The principal actor is the municipality who actually has the responsibility for the cleanliness of the city, but already for some years were not capable to realise this. Other actors are the private companies, working in waste management and the informal sector working in waste management especially the waste pickers on the dumpsite and the pre-collectors who do door to door collection.

And lastly, there are the beneficiaries, the people of Tuléar, who will live in a cleaner city, less prone to inundations due to blocked water ways and thus a healthier city.

The actual evaluation is done by 2 evaluators of which one dealt mainly with the institutional and organisational aspects, while the other focussed more on the actual waste management system that was being set up

Relevance

It can be stated that the project PASSAT is relevant on various levels. The city Tuléar is in need to be cleaned up, the dumpsite on the border of the town is situated in an area prone to flooding during the cyclone season and as such is totally unsuited to be turned into an improved disposal site.

On a national level it would be interesting to have a good example how a secondary town can work together with private enterprises to come to a working waste management system.

Effectiveness

The project is halfway at the moment of the evaluation and it is clear that much has happened and already some changes in the city can be observed. There are 25 bins placed at 22 locations, which are collected on a daily basis by 3 trucks by WHH. Even though the waste is still dumped at the old uncontrolled dumpsite, the plans to realise a new disposal site a bit further away from the town are advancing. The new disposal site will have the facility to separate waste streams and to do some valorisation activities. The main activity will be composting and making briquettes for cooking purposes. Additionally, there will be opportunities to recycle plastics into tiles.

Efficiency

The project has had its problems at the beginning as the ISF a former partner left the project. However they were involved in the baseline study, which forms the basis of the work plan for the project.

The leaving of ISF resulted in a lack of expertise in the area of waste management, and it has taken some time to fill in the vacancy. The fact that the first mayor was not interested in the project, also caused for delays in the project. But the new mayor however is very much interested and active and would like to be involved.

Despite the earlier set-backs it has to be said that the project advances quite quickly. The collection of waste is happening regularly, the system is being adapted.

At the same time the capacity building activities of the municipality, and actively involving the main actors such as door-to-door collectors and waste pickers is behind schedule.

Outcomes and impacts

The logical framework names two outcomes for the urban part of the programme concerning the solid waste management part of the project.

Result 1¹: An adapted waste management and treatment system is installed in partnership with the municipality and the local actors, improving the public health and the preventing vulnerability of the city for natural disasters.

Indicators

- Local actors are involved in a more coordinated and responsible waste management.
- The waste collection system is adapted to the needs of the city.
- The social-economic vulnerable groups are trained on door to door collection and waste separation and are organised.
- Valorisation of at least three recyclable product are set up and working (compost, briquettes, biogas, plastic, aluminum)

Based on the observations of the evaluators, it can be said that most indicators are on their way. The waste bins are used, even if not all waste ends up in the bins it is clear that the population uses them. In the cases that the waste is thrown next to the bin, there can be reasons other than pure unwillingness. Children might not be able to reach that high, the bin might be full, or placed in a such a way that it not inviting to throw the waste in it. It is noted that even if there are no skips available in the neighbourhood, citizens

¹ In French :

Résultat 1: *Un système de gestion et traitement des déchets adapté est en place en partenariat avec la municipalité et les acteurs locaux afin d'améliorer la santé publique et la prévention des catastrophes.*

Indicateurs :

- *Les acteurs locaux s'impliquent de manière plus en plus concertée et responsable dans la gestion des déchets.*
- *Le système de ramassage des déchets est adapté au besoin de la ville.*
- *Les groupements de base (couche socioéconomique vulnérable) sont formés à la collecte et au tri des déchets et sont organisés.*
- *Des filières de valorisation sont mises en place pour au moins trois produits recyclables (compost, briquette, biogaz, plastique, aluminium).*

put their waste with the sweepings, which they know will be collected during the same, day. The research done by the WHH also shows that the cleaning of the city is greatly appreciated.



Photo. Bins placed with the entrance opposite of each other, not inviting to use
©Vdevreede

The planned waste management system is not yet fully in place, but most of the skips are placed, and the collection is done on a regular basis. The rest of the chain, the door to door collection, the separation, recycling, valorisation and proper final disposal are still in the stage or trial and error. The ideas for valorisation are still coming up especially around the organic waste, the biggest fraction of the Tuléar waste production.

The plans for valorisation are not yet shared with possible entrepreneurs or groups who might be interested in recycling, and as such nothing can be said about the success perspectives, except that with the remaining time of the project it becomes more difficult to set up a working and permanent valorisation chain.

Result 2²: Better access to basic sanitation, more hygiene awareness raising, contributing s to higher hygienic awareness of the population and a change in behaviour regarding hygiene.

Indicators:

- The open air defecation points in Tuléar are reduced by 50% by raising awareness and rehabilitation of public latrines.

² In French:

Résultat 2 : *Un meilleur accès aux infrastructures sanitaires de base, ainsi que la sensibilisation à l'hygiène, contribue à une meilleure prise de conscience de la population et à un changement de comportement concernant l'hygiène.*

Indicators :

- *Les points de défécation à l'air libre sont réduits de 50% par les mesures de sensibilisation et la réhabilitation des latrines publiques.*
- *20 nouveaux points d'eau fournissent de l'eau potable pendant toute l'année et à proximité pour au moins 4.000 personnes.*

- 20 new drinking water points functioning all year round and are close by for at least 4,000 people.
- At least 5,000 people (heads of households, women, children) have been reached and are able to describe good and bad behaviour on hygiene and cleanliness.

The sanitation, particularly the realisation of basic sanitation infrastructure is still very difficult in Tuléar. The options for pit latrine emptying of private and public toilets are very limited. In the current situation, improving public toilets only is a temporary solution as the toilets are defunct the moment the pit is filled up.

The awareness campaigns and the communication activities around hygiene and cleanliness are very visible in the city and the visits to schools and the evenings in the fokontany are known by the population.

Sustainability

Despite all the positive elements of the project the evaluators are concerned that the project as a whole does not have a big chance to be sustainable. The most important one is that currently the municipality does not feel an active actor in the process of setting up the waste management system. Part of the planning processes escapes them, their role is more in execution of certain activities than planning and managing. Their level of decision making is low (for example decide where the bins are places, once the project has decided how many...) In reality, it is the project that provides the waste management service and not the municipality, it remains the involved executor of the planned waste management activities, and is not the driver. They do not have the opportunity to get familiarised with a functioning system and become owners of the project.

Also the involvement of entrepreneurs who can and would want to work in the valorisation of the waste fractions are not yet involved in the project. This is absolutely needed to reduce the amount of waste at the final disposal site (CSVD) give the recycling activities an chance to become a success and economic viable.

Most important recommendations

The most important recommendation is that the municipality should become more involved in the waste management part of the project. This does not mean that the municipality should do all activities, but that the division of work is clear, that the municipality is up to date with the progress in the project and is involved in decision making on infrastructure, set up of the whole waste management chain and system. There are several actions that can be taken up, but one of the advises is to twin the personnel from WHH working on certain themes in the projects, with similar personnel within the municipality.

Additionally, the evaluators advise to that an intensive contact between WHH and municipality is essential and a joint work plan has to be set up. The work plan will also have to include capacity development of the different involved departments of the municipality. In some cases the capacity building would be even outside the field of direct waste management, for instance tax collection or training on decentralisation and the forming of PPPs. In Tuléar there will probably be opportunities to link up with other programmes

-
- *Au moins 5.000 personnes (chefs de ménages, femmes, enfants) ont été sensibilisées et sont capables de décrire le bon et mauvais comportement en matière d'hygiène et propreté.*

and projects working on these urban issues. In this perspective it is recommended to support the municipality in developing a plan on sanitation and solid waste that can also be supported by MEAH (Ministry of Water, Sanitation & Hygiene) through its Sanitation Master Plans for development of the project eight secondary cities in Madagascar - Toliara which, for that project efforts are not ignored in the process initiated by the MEAH to secondary cities³

Another recommendation is to search for entrepreneurs who would like to be involved in the small-scale valorisation of recyclables. To ensure sustainability of the system the valorisation should be in hands of the private sector. Doing pilot projects only with NGOs will make it difficult to aim consolidate the activities.

The waste pickers and door-to-door collection need also to be involved more in the project. If the waste pickers do not have an alternative source of income after the old waste dump closes the waste pickers will go to the new disposal site and continue what their work. Or if this is made impossible by the security there is a big risk that they will start waste picking from the collection bins, which is not desirable. Regarding the children working on the dumpsite, it is advised to try to link up with organisations like Bel'avenir and UNICEF to ensure that.

³ Voir le lien : <http://www.mineau.gov.mg/avis-general-de-passation-des-marches-madagascar-schema-directeurs-dassainissement-de-8-villes-secondaires-de-madagascar>